



July 26, 2019

VIA EMAIL

Michael Marquis
Freedom of Information Officer
U.S. Department of Health and Human
Services
Hubert H. Humphrey Building, Room
729H
200 Independence Avenue SW
Washington, DC 20201
FOIARequest@hhs.gov

Hugh Gilmore
Freedom of Information Officer
U.S. Centers for Medicare & Medicaid
Services
North Building, Room N2-20-06
7500 Security Boulevard
Baltimore, Maryland 21244
FOIA_Request@cms.hhs.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear FOIA Officers:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of your agency, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

Since taking office, the Trump administration has taken an array of actions undermining or directly attacking the Affordable Care Act (ACA).¹ These efforts have included various moves that have had the effect of increasing premiums in the individual health insurance market and reducing enrollment through the ACA's Health Insurance Marketplaces.² This

¹ See, e.g., *Roundup: Administration Efforts to Sabotage the Affordable Care Act*, CTR. ON BUDGET & POLICY PRIORITIES (May 16, 2019, 8:00 AM), <https://www.cbpp.org/blog/roundup-administration-efforts-to-sabotage-the-affordable-care-act>; Susan Rinkunas, *All the Ways Donald Trump Has Sabotaged Obamacare [Updated]*, VICE (updated July 10, 2018), https://www.vice.com/en_us/article/pa3k4z/donald-trump-obamacare-sabotage; Joshua Holland, *Everything Trump Is Doing to Sabotage the Affordable Care Act*, THE NATION, Nov. 7, 2017, <https://www.thenation.com/article/everything-trump-is-doing-to-sabotage-the-affordable-care-act/>.

² Michael Hiltzik, *Trump's Assault on Obamacare Was Much More Damaging Than Previously Thought*, L.A. Times (Jun, 18, 2019, 10:58 AM), <https://www.latimes.com/business/hiltzik/la-fi-hiltzik-trump-assault-obamacare-20190618-story.html>; Charles Gaba, *The Chart That Shows the Price Tag for Trump's Obamacare Sabotage*, N.Y. Times, Dec. 27, 2018, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/12/27/opinion/trump-obamacare-sabotage-chart-cost.html>; Jonathan Cohn, *These Are the Real-Life Effects of Trump's Obamacare Sabotage*,



trend has continued with respect to the upcoming 2020 plan year, with the administration finalizing changes to the premium indexing methodology used to calculate the required contribution amount towards premiums for consumers in the Health Insurance Marketplace and to set rate increases for the maximum annual limitation on cost-sharing, among other things.³ The predicted effect of this change — as documented in an August 29, 2018 memorandum from Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services (CMS) Administrator Seema Verma to Secretary of HHS Alex Azar — will be to “cause coverage losses, further premium increases, and market disruption.”⁴ Indeed, for this reason, Administrator Verma herself opposed this change prior to issuance of the proposed rule,⁵ and “[a]ll commenters on this topic [in the proposed rule] expressed opposition to or concerns about the proposed change[.]”⁶

American Oversight seeks records to shed light on the administration’s decision to overrule CMS Administrator Verma, including the factual analyses available to the administration when this decision was made.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that your agency produce the following records within twenty business days:

1. Any decision memoranda other records documenting the approval, legality, or rationale relating to the decisions to propose and to finalize changes to the annual premium adjustment percentage for plan year 2020.
2. Any and all analyses, including actuarial, economic, and fiscal analyses, to determine the impact(s) of changing the premium indexing methodology in plan

HUFFPOST (Feb. 25, 2018, 12:26 PM), https://www.huffpost.com/entry/these-are-the-real-life-effects-of-trumps-obamacare-sabotage_n_5a9424dfe4b03b55731e5a30.

³ HHS Notice of Benefit & Payment Parameters for 2020, 84 Fed. Reg. 17454, 17537–41 (Apr. 25, 2019) (codified at 45 C.F.R. § 156.130) (2020 Final Rule).

⁴ Mem. from Seema Verma, CMS Adm’r to Alex Azar, Sec’y of HHS at 12 (Aug. 29, 2019), <https://energycommerce.house.gov/sites/democrats.energycommerce.house.gov/files/documents/August%202018%20Verma%20Azar%20Memo.pdf> (Verma Mem.); see also Aviva Aron-Dine & Matt Broaddus, *Change to Insurance Payment Formulas Would Raise Costs for Millions with Marketplace or Employer Plans*, CTR. ON BUDGET & POLICY PRIORITIES (updated Apr. 26, 2019), <https://www.cbpp.org/research/health/change-to-insurance-payment-formulas-would-raise-costs-for-millions-with-marketplace>; Steven Porter, *Critics Warn Premiums Will Rise under CMS’ Tweaked 2020 Subsidy Formula*, HEALTHLEADERS, April 19, 2019, <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/critics-warn-premiums-will-rise-under-cms-tweaked-2020-subsidy-formula>.

⁵ Verma Mem. at 12.

⁶ 2020 Final Rule at 17539.

year 2020, including to impacts on enrollment, premiums, consumer choice, individual market stability, consumer and federal spending, and coverage levels.

3. All email communications (including emails, email attachments, calendar invitations, and any attachments thereto) between or among Administrator Verma and any of the individuals listed below regarding the decisions to propose and to finalize changes to the annual premium adjustment percentage (a.k.a., premium indexing methodology, premium growth measure, or premium growth rate) for plan year 2020, including any emails related to the impact of these changes.

- a. Any individual employed by the White House (email addresses ending in @who.eop.gov), including but not limited to:
 - i. Mick Mulvaney, Acting Chief of Staff
 - ii. Joe Grogan, Assistant to the President for Domestic Policy
 - iii. Andrew Bremberg, former Assistant to the President for Domestic Policy
 - iv. Lance Leggett, former Deputy Assistant to the President for Domestic Policy
- b. Any individuals employed by the Office of Management and Budget (email addresses ending in @omb.eop.gov), including but not limited to:
 - i. Mick Mulvaney, Director of the Office of Management and Budget
 - ii. Russell Vought, Deputy Director of the Office of Management and Budget
 - iii. Paul Ray, Acting Administrator of the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
 - iv. Neomi Rao, former Administrator of the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
- c. Alex Azar, Secretary of Health and Human Services
- d. Brady Brookes, Deputy Chief of Staff, Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services
- e. Paul Spitalnic, Director and Chief Actuary, Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services
- f. Trent Morse, White House Liaison, Department of Health and Human Services
- g. Tim Clark, former White House Liaison, Department of Health and Human Services

Please provide all responsive records from July 1, 2018, through June 30, 2019.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency's regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is "in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government."⁷ The public has a significant interest in the executive branch of the federal government upholding and implementing federal law, including the Affordable Care Act, which remains the law of the land. Records with the potential to shed light on the Administration's implementation of the Affordable Care Act would contribute significantly to public understanding of operations of the federal government, including whether and to what extent the administration is taking steps to undermine the law. American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public's understanding of the government's activities would be enhanced through American Oversight's analysis and publication of these records.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁸ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight's financial interest. American Oversight's mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.⁹

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through numerous substantive analyses posted to its website.¹⁰ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to

⁷ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁸ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁹ American Oversight currently has approximately 12,600 followers on Facebook and 54,400 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, FACEBOOK, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited July 16, 2019); American Oversight (@weareoversight), TWITTER, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited July 16, 2019).

¹⁰ News, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department’s process for issuing such waivers;¹¹ posting records received as part of American Oversight’s “Audit the Wall” project to gather and analyze information related to the administration’s proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹² posting records regarding potential self-dealing at the Department of Housing & Urban Development and related analysis;¹³ posting records and analysis relating to the federal government’s efforts to sell nuclear technology to Saudi Arabia;¹⁴ and posting records and analysis regarding the Department of Justice’s decision in response to demands from Congress to direct a U.S. Attorney to undertake a wide-ranging review and make recommendations regarding criminal investigations relating to the President’s political opponents and allegations of misconduct by the Department of Justice itself and the Federal Bureau of Investigation.¹⁵

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Please search all locations and systems likely to have responsive records, regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. For instance, if the request seeks “communications,” please search all locations likely to contain communications, including relevant hard-copy files, correspondence files, appropriate locations on

¹¹ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco’s Recusal*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

¹² *See generally Audit the Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; *see, e.g., Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

¹³ *Documents Reveal Ben Carson Jr.’s Attempts to Use His Influence at HUD to Help His Business*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/documents-reveal-ben-carson-jr-s-attempts-to-use-his-influence-at-hud-to-help-his-business>.

¹⁴ *Investigating the Trump Administration’s Efforts to Sell Nuclear Technology to Saudi Arabia*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigating-the-trump-administrations-efforts-to-sell-nuclear-technology-to-saudi-arabia>.

¹⁵ *Sessions’ Letter Shows DOJ Acted on Trump’s Authoritarian Demand to Investigate Clinton*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/sessions-letter>.

hard drives and shared drives, emails, text messages or other direct messaging systems (such as iMessage, WhatsApp, Signal, or Twitter direct messages), voicemail messages, instant messaging systems such as Lync or ICQ, and shared messages systems such as Slack.

- In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages, and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations, or discussions.
- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹⁶ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁷
- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁸ and many agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA)

¹⁶ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹⁷ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

¹⁸ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency's archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Christine H. Monahan at foia@americanoversight.org

or (202) 788-0606. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Austin R. Evers", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the left.

Austin R. Evers
Executive Director
American Oversight