



October 17, 2019

VIA ONLINE PORTAL

U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development
Freedom of Information Act Office
451 7th Street SW, Room 10139
Washington, DC 20410-3000
Via Online Portal

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear Freedom of Information Act Officer:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), 24 C.F.R. Part 15, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

On July 27, 2019, President Trump tweeted that Maryland's 7th Congressional District, which encompasses over half of Baltimore County, was a "disgusting, rat and rodent infested mess" and a "very dangerous[,] filthy place."¹ The tweets followed Representative Elijah Cummings' criticism of the conditions at Department of Homeland Security detention centers.² Four days later, HUD Secretary Ben Carson visited Baltimore and defended the President's remarks.³ HUD emails and calendars obtained by American

¹ Donald J. Trump (@realDonaldTrump), TWITTER (July 27, 2019, 7:14 AM and 7:24 AM), https://twitter.com/realDonaldTrump/status/1155073965880172544?ref_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Ettweetembed%7Ctwterm%5E1155073965880172544&ref_url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.baltimoresun.com%2Fpolitics%2Fbs-md-pol-cummings-trump-20190727-ghty2yovtvfzfcjkeai7wm5zi-story.html; https://twitter.com/realDonaldTrump/status/1155076476930338816?ref_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Ettweetembed%7Ctwterm%5E1155076476930338816&ref_url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.baltimoresun.com%2Fpolitics%2Fbs-md-pol-cummings-trump-20190727-ghty2yovtvfzfcjkeai7wm5zi-story.html.

² Wilbourn P. Nobles III, *Trump Calls Baltimore 'Disgusting ... Rodent Infested Mess,' Rips Rep. Elijah Cummings Over Border Criticism*, BALTIMORE SUN (July 27, 2019: 10:21 PM), <https://www.baltimoresun.com/politics/bs-md-pol-cummings-trump-20190727-ghty2yovtvfzfcjkeai7wm5zi-story.html>.

³ Ovetta Wiggins, *HUD Secretary Ben Carson: 'A Lot of Good Things in Baltimore, But There Are a Lot of Bad Things, Too'*, WASH. POST (July 31, 2019: 9:22 PM), https://www.washingtonpost.com/local/md-politics/in-baltimore-ben-carson-defends-president-trumps-harsh-depiction-of-the-city/2019/07/31/a8741f78-b37f-11e9-951e-de024209545d_story.html.



Oversight and by the press have revealed that members of the Carson family have played expansive roles at HUD.⁴ Specifically, Ben “BJ” Carson, Jr., helped plan Secretary Carson’s 2017 Baltimore tour.⁵

American Oversight seeks records to shed light on whether and to what extent Secretary Carson’s son has further influenced or orchestrated the Secretary’s trips to Baltimore.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that HUD produce the following records within twenty business days:

All records reflecting communications (including emails, email attachments, text messages, calendar invitations/entries, meeting notices, meeting agendas, informational material, talking points, any handwritten or electronic notes taken during any oral communications, summaries of any oral communications, or other materials) concerning the July 31, 2019 visit by HUD Secretary Ben Carson exchanged between (a) Secretary Carson, or anyone communicating on his behalf such as a Chief of Staff, assistant, or scheduler and (b) any of the individuals listed below:

- a. Secretary Carson’s spouse Candy Carson
- b. Secretary Carson’s son, Benjamin Carson, Jr. (including but not limited to email addresses ending in interprisepartners.com)
- c. Secretary Carson’s daughter-in-law, Dr. Merlynn Carson (including but not limited to the email addresses Merlynnj21@hotmail.com, Merlynnj1386@gmail.com, Merlynnj@hotmail.com, mcarson@myrriidian.com, and any other email address ending in myrriidian.com).

⁴ *Documents Reveal Ben Carson Jr.’s Attempts to Use His Influence at HUD to Help His Business*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/documents-reveal-ben-carson-jr-s-attempts-to-use-his-influence-at-hud-to-help-his-business>; *HUD Records Relating to Ben Carson Jr.*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/hud-records-relating-ben-carson-jr>.

⁵ Alec MacGillis, *Is Anybody Home at HUD*, N.Y. MAG. (Aug. 22, 2017, 8:00 am), <http://nymag.com/daily/intelligencer/2017/08/ben-carson-hud-secretary.html>; Juana Summers *et al.*, *Emails Show Carson Family Fingerprints at HUD Despite Warnings*, CNN (Feb. 5, 2018, 12:44 PM) <https://www.cnn.com/2018/02/02/politics/ben-carson-family-hud/index.html>; Juliet Eilperin & Jack Gillum, *‘Using His Position for Private Gain’: Ben Carson Was Warned He Might Run Afoul of Ethics Rules by Enlisting His Son*, WASH. POST, Jan. 31, 2018, https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/using-his-position-for-private-gain-hud-lawyers-warned-ben-carson-risked-running-afoul-of-ethics-rules-by-enlisting-son/2018/01/31/bb20c48e-0532-11e8-8777-2a059f168dd2_story.html?utm_term=.0f7a4a2533fb.

Please provide all responsive records from July 6, 2019, through August 2, 2019.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency's regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is "in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government."⁶ The President's remarks about Baltimore were widely criticized, and Secretary Carson's subsequent visit was widely publicized.⁷ The public deserves to know whether and to what extent a high-ranking Cabinet official relied on family contacts to plan a highly-politicized trip. The public deserves to have confidence that HUD's decisions and the Secretary's visits have been made without undue outside influence and that members of the Carson family are not serving as de facto liaisons between HUD and local governments. American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public's understanding of the government's activities would be enhanced through American Oversight's analysis and publication of these records.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁸ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight's financial interest. American Oversight's mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.⁹

⁶ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁷ *Supra* note 4; see also Peter Nicholas, *Ben Carson's Appearance in Baltimore Didn't Go as Planned*, THE ATLANTIC, July 31, 2019, <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2019/07/baltimore-ben-carson-trump/595207/>; see also Katy O'Donnell, *Ben Carson Defends Trump, Compares Baltimore to Cancer Patient*, POLITICO (July 31, 2019: 2:40 PM), <https://www.politico.com/story/2019/07/31/carson-defends-trump-baltimore-1629618>.

⁸ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁹ American Oversight currently has approximately 12,260 page likes on Facebook and 54,900 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, FACEBOOK, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Oct. 15, 2019); American

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through numerous substantive analyses posted to its website.¹⁰ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department's process for issuing such waivers;¹¹ posting records received as part of American Oversight's "Audit the Wall" project to gather and analyze information related to the administration's proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹² posting records regarding potential self-dealing at the Department of Housing & Urban Development and related analysis;¹³ posting records and analysis relating to the federal government's efforts to sell nuclear technology to Saudi Arabia;¹⁴ posting records and analysis regarding the Department of Justice's decision in response to demands from Congress to direct a U.S. Attorney to undertake a wide-ranging review and make recommendations regarding criminal investigations relating to the President's political opponents and allegations of misconduct by the Department of Justice itself and the Federal Bureau of Investigation.¹⁵

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Oversight (@weareoversight), TWITTER, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited Oct. 15, 2019).

¹⁰ *News*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

¹¹ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco's Recusal*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

¹² *See generally Audit the Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; *see, e.g., Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

¹³ *Documents Reveal Ben Carson Jr.'s Attempts to Use His Influence at HUD to Help His Business*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/documents-reveal-ben-carson-jr-s-attempts-to-use-his-influence-at-hud-to-help-his-business>.

¹⁴ *Investigating the Trump Administration's Efforts to Sell Nuclear Technology to Saudi Arabia*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigating-the-trump-administrations-efforts-to-sell-nuclear-technology-to-saudi-arabia>.

¹⁵ *Sessions' Letter Shows DOJ Acted On Trump's Authoritarian Demand to Investigate Clinton*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/sessions-letter>.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Please search all locations and systems likely to have responsive records, regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. For instance, if the request seeks “communications,” please search all locations likely to contain communications, including relevant hard-copy files, correspondence files, appropriate locations on hard drives and shared drives, emails, text messages or other direct messaging systems (such as iMessage, WhatsApp, Signal, or Twitter direct messages), voicemail messages, instant messaging systems such as Lync or ICQ, and shared messages systems such as Slack.
- In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations or discussions.
- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹⁶ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files

¹⁶ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁷

- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁸ and many agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency’s archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.
- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or

¹⁷ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

¹⁸ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Khahilia Shaw at foia@americanoversight.org or at 202.539.6507. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Austin R. Evers", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the left.

Austin R. Evers
Executive Director
American Oversight