



April 27, 2021

VIA EMAIL

Freedom of Information Act Office
U.S. Immigration & Customs Enforcement
500 12th Street SW, Stop 5009
Washington, DC 20536-5009
ice-foia@dhs.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear FOIA Officer:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of your agency, 6 C.F.R. Part 5, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

Thomson Reuters advertises its Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) database as a “powerful research platform” delivering a “vast collection of public and proprietary records,” including comprehensive cell phone data, social media data, consumer and credit bureau information, motor vehicle registration data, and utilities data (e.g., electric, gas, satellite, water), among other sources.¹ On January 19, 2017, the U.S. Department of Homeland Security (DHS) paid \$20.6 million to West Publishing Corporation, a subsidiary of Thomson Reuters, for a subscription to its CLEAR database.² In letters to the CEOs of Thomson Reuters and Equifax, the House Committee on Oversight and Reform expressed concern that Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) uses the data available in the CLEAR system to surveil and target undocumented immigrants for deportation.³ The contract period ended on February 28, 2021.⁴

¹ Thomson Reuters, *CLEAR Brochure: The Smarter Way to Get Your Investigative Facts Straight*, <https://www.thomsonreuters.com/content/dam/openweb/documents/pdf/legal/fact-sheet/clear-brochure.pdf>.

² See, e.g., USA Spending, *Contract to West Publishing Corporation*, www.usaspending.gov/award/CONT_AWD_HSCEMD17F00008_7012_GS02F026DA_4732); Record of award, released by Privacy International, June 20, 2018, <https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/4546854-TR-Attachment-1.html>.

³ Letters from Reps. Raja Krishnamoorthi and Jimmy Gomez to Stephen Hasker and Mark W. Begor, Feb. 26, 2021, <https://oversight.house.gov/news/press-releases/oversight-subcommittee-launches-investigation-into-sale-of-utility-customer-info>).

⁴ See USA Spending, *supra* note 2.



American Oversight seeks records with the potential to help the public better understand the extent to which ICE has used the CLEAR database, the purpose(s) for which the database has been used, and the privacy and security safeguards in place.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) produce the following records within twenty business days:

1. Any final contracts formed between ICE and Thomson Reuters or its subsidiaries (including, but not limited, to West Publishing Corporation), as well as the solicitations or requests for proposals relevant to those contracts, concerning the Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) database.
2. Any security or privacy audit(s) conducted of the Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) data system.
3. Any performance audit(s), impact assessment(s), or evaluation(s) of the Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) database conducted since January 19, 2017, namely, in relation to delivery order: HSCEMD17F00008 (awarded January 19, 2017).⁵
4. Any guidance documents, training materials, policies, procedures, or instructions regarding how ICE personnel should use the Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) database, received from Thomson Reuters or its subsidiaries (including, but not limited, to West Publishing Corporation), or produced and circulated by ICE.
5. Records sufficient to identify the total number of arrests, detentions, and deportations as a result of ICE personnel using the Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) database.
6. All communications (including emails and email attachments) **between** (a) any of the ICE employees listed in Column A below, and (b) any of the individuals or entities listed in Column B below, including, but not limited, to anyone communicating from the email addresses and domains specified:

Column A: ICE Employees	Column B: Outside Entities
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Any person serving in the capacity of Director (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021). b. Any person serving in the capacity of Deputy Director (including in an Acting capacity) 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Anyone with a Thomson Reuters email address (@tr.com; @thomsonreuters.com) b. Steve Hasker (President and CEO, Thomson Reuters) c. James C. Smith (Former President and CEO, Thomson Reuters)

⁵ See Record of Award, *supra* note 2.

<p>during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021).</p> <p>c. Any person serving in the capacity of Chief of Staff (including Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021)</p> <p>d. Any person serving in the capacity of Director and Head of Contracting Activity (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021).</p> <p>e. Any person serving in the capacity of Executive Associate Director for Management and Administration (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021)</p> <p>f. Any person serving in the capacity of Executive Associate Director for Enforcement and Removal Operations (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021)</p> <p>g. Any person serving in the capacity of Associate Director for the Office of Professional Responsibility (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021)</p> <p>h. Any person serving in the capacity of Director and Head of Contracting Activity (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021)</p> <p>i. Any person serving in the capacity of Principal Legal Advisor (including in an Acting capacity) during the contract period (Jan. 19, 2017-Feb. 28, 2021)</p> <p>j. Any person serving in the capacity of Contracting Officer</p>	<p>d. Brian Peccarelli (Chief Operating Officer, Company Markets, Thomson Reuters)</p> <p>e. Anyone communicating on behalf of Steve Hasker, such as a secretary or assistant</p> <p>f. Anyone communicating on behalf of James C. Smith, such as a secretary or assistant</p> <p>g. Anyone communicating on behalf of Brian Peccarelli, such as a secretary or assistant</p> <p>h. Anyone with a Holland & Knight email address (@hklaw.com)</p> <p>i. Kathryn Lehman (Kathryn.Lehman@hklaw.com)</p> <p>j. Joel Roberson (Joel.Roberson@hklaw.com)</p> <p>k. Marissa Serafino (Marissa.Serafino@hklaw.com)</p> <p>l. Scott Mason (Scott.Mason@hklaw.com)</p> <p>m. Ethan Jorgensen-Earp (Ethan.Jorgensen-Earp@hklaw.com)</p>
---	---

(CO) or Contracting Officer Technical Representative (COTR) for any contracts related to the CLEAR database	
--	--

For all parts of this request, please provide all responsive records from January 19, 2017 through the date the search is conducted.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency’s regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is “in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government.”⁶ The public has a significant interest in ICE’s use of commercial utility and personal data to conduct its operations.⁷ ICE’s previous contracts with Thomson Reuters and its subsidiary, West Publishing Corporation, have raised questions about the privacy and security implications of obtaining such data.⁸ Records with the potential to shed more light on this issue would contribute significantly to public understanding of federal government operations, including whether ICE has used the Consolidated Lead Evaluation and Reporting (CLEAR) database to identify undocumented immigrants for detention or deportation. American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public’s understanding of the government’s activities would be enhanced through American Oversight’s analysis and publication of these records.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁹ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight’s financial interest. American Oversight’s mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight

⁶ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁷ See, e.g., Alvaro M. Bedoya, *The Cruel New Era of Data-Driven Deportation*, Slate (Sept. 22, 2020) <https://slate.com/technology/2020/09/palantir-ice-deportation-immigrant-surveillance-big-data.html>.

⁸ See, e.g., Chantal Da Silva, *City Refuses To Let ICE Track License Plates With ‘Digital Deportation Machine’*, Newsweek (Feb. 14, 2018) <https://www.newsweek.com/city-refuses-let-ice-track-licenses-places-digital-deportation-machine-806845>.

⁹ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.¹⁰

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through regular substantive analyses posted to its website.¹¹ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to the Trump Administration's contacts with Ukraine and analyses of those contacts;¹² posting records and editorial content about the federal government's response to the Coronavirus pandemic;¹³ posting records received as part of American Oversight's "Audit the Wall" project to gather and analyze information related to the administration's proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹⁴ the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department's process for issuing such waivers;¹⁵ and posting records and analysis of federal officials' use of taxpayer dollars to charter private aircraft or use government planes for unofficial business.¹⁶

¹⁰ American Oversight currently has approximately 15,700 page likes on Facebook and 106,200 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, Facebook, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Apr. 26, 2021); American Oversight (@weareoversight), Twitter, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited Apr. 26, 2021).

¹¹ See generally *News*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

¹² *Trump Administration's Contacts with Ukraine*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/the-trump-administrations-contacts-with-ukraine>.

¹³ See generally *The Trump Administration's Response to Coronavirus*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/the-trump-administrations-response-to-coronavirus>; see, e.g., *CDC Calendars from 2018 and 2019: Pandemic-Related Briefings and Meetings*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/cdc-calendars-from-2018-and-2019-pandemic-related-briefings-and-meetings>.

¹⁴ See generally *Audit the Wall*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; see, e.g., *Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

¹⁵ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco's Recusal*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

¹⁶ See generally *Swamp Airlines: Chartered Jets at Taxpayer Expense*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/swamp-airlines-private-jets-taxpayer-expense>; see, e.g., *New Information on Pompeo's 2017 Trips to His Home State*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/new-information-on-pompeos-2017-trips-to-his-home-state>.

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records:

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Please search all locations and systems likely to have responsive records, regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. For instance, if the request seeks “communications,” please search all locations likely to contain communications, including relevant hard-copy files, correspondence files, appropriate locations on hard drives and shared drives, emails, text messages or other direct messaging systems (such as iMessage, WhatsApp, Signal, or Twitter direct messages), voicemail messages, instant messaging systems such as Lync or ICQ, and shared messages systems such as Slack.
- In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages, and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations, or discussions.
- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹⁷ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁸

¹⁷ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹⁸ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁹ and many agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency’s archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.
- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will

¹⁹ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Hart Wood at foia@americanoversight.org or by phone at 202-873-1743. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Hart Wood
Hart Wood
on behalf of
American Oversight